

Tuesday – May 9, 2017 - 5:00 p.m.

Regular Meeting

Present: Mayor Esther E. Manheimer, Presiding; Vice-Mayor Gwen C. Wisler; Councilman Cecil Bothwell; Councilman Brian D. Haynes; Councilwoman Julie V. Mayfield; Councilman Gordon D. Smith; Councilman W. Keith Young; City Manager Gary W. Jackson; City Attorney Robin T. Currin; and City Clerk Magdalen Burleson

Absent: None

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Mayor Manheimer led City Council in the Pledge of Allegiance.

I. PROCLAMATIONS:

A. RECOGNITION OF CITY OF ASHEVILLE YOUTH LEADERSHIP ACADEMY STUDENTS

Mayor Manheimer ten years ago, former Mayor Terry Bellamy and the Asheville City Council envisioned a new program that would place students with meaningful summer internships with City departments and partnering organizations throughout Asheville. This program would empower its students to get involved in our community, support them in their quest for college, and reward them with a generous scholarship. After a rigorous application process each spring, 25 City of Asheville Youth Leadership Academy (CAYLA) students are placed in prestigious summer internships that allow them to explore careers and learn from caring adult professionals. Members of the CAYLA Class of 2017 interned with valuable community partners, including Habitat for Humanity, CarePartners, and the Omni Grove Park Inn. Each Friday during the summer, the students attended day-long leadership workshops that focused on social entrepreneurship. Students learned about the triple bottom line that considers a company's social, economic and environmental impact. The students also met business professionals whose passions have led to the creation of local social enterprises, and took a variety of field trips to see such careers in action. Of the graduating seniors, all have been accepted to colleges – and many have earned significant merit scholarships, including the UNC Asheville AVID Scholars award, the Golden Doors Scholarship, and the Civitan and Rotary scholarships. This year, the total merit scholarship money earned by CAYLA students since 2008 will surpass \$1.3 million. Beginning last June, the CAYLA students began planning in-depth social justice projects. They organized the sixth annual MLK Youth Summit, which brought together more than 60 teenagers from all of Buncombe County's high schools to discuss issues of importance to youth. The CALYA students also taught a class each week for Asheville City Schools Foundation's IRL afterschool program. Over the years, CAYLA students have given more than 3,600 volunteer hours to our community. In recognition of their accomplishments and the critical role they will play in Asheville's future, the City of Asheville awards each CAYLA student a scholarship in the amount of \$2,000. We are proud of the leadership that the CAYLA students exhibit each day, and look forward to hearing of their achievements in the years to come.

With that, she provided a certificate to the following 2017 CAYLA students: Candida Alas-Ortega, CeeCret Allen, Isabel Arredondo, Angelique Ayoade, Mercy Beveridge, Devin Boston, Dana Campbell, Jr., Zoe Cecil, Korina Dariy, Tanya Davila, Cederia Davis, D'Angelo Elliott, Itzel Garcia Ruiz, Keenan Hines, Erykah Howard, Rayanna Inniss, Shamone Jones, Arianna Moore, Myra Pearson, Jamie Rhodes, Jasmine Riddle, Sophia Rutherford, Angel Vasquez Ramirez, Zion Walker, and Ashley White.

Mayor Manheimer praised Erika Germer for her hard work on this program.

B. EMPLOYEE RECOGNITIONS

City Manager Jackson recognized the following individuals for their work on the Public Safety Radio System Update: Jonathan Feldman, Jeff Reble, Capt. Jeremy Edmonds, Capt. Gary Gudac, Boyd McCaskill, Lt. Bill Wilke, Norris Going, Dan Lemley, Cathey Trimnal, Joy Griffin, Tim Reimers, Steve Frey, Stan Smith, Fire Chief Scott Burnette, Police Chief Tammy Hooper, Assistant City Manager Paul Fetherston, and Finance Director Barbara Whitehorn; with partners of ERC - Fiber Provider; Buncombe County – Strategic Partner; Communications Service - Steve Robison; and Trott Communications - Keith Whitt. In addition, City Manager Jackson recognized Director of Communications & Public Engagement Dawa Hitch and her team of Jaime Matthews, Dan Phairas, Christy Edwards, Sarah Sheldon, Christen McNamara, and Melissa Van Sickle for their work in obtaining the following three Excellence in Communications Awards from the North Carolina City & County Communicators recognized the City of Asheville with three Excellence in Communications Awards: (1) First place for the bond campaign in the category of Citizen Participation; (2) Second place for the bond campaign projects tour; and (3) One-time special video programming award for the bond campaign video.

Mayor Manheimer thanked the employees on what they do on behalf of the City of Asheville and City Council. She was proud of City staff and looked forward to highlighting more accomplishments.

C. PROCLAMATION PROCLAIMING MAY, 2017, AS "MOTORCYCLE AWARENESS MONTH"

Mayor Manheimer read the proclamation proclaiming May, 2017, as "Motorcycle Awareness Month" in the City of Asheville. She presented the proclamation to Jody Martin, representing the Concerned Bikers Association of North Carolina, who outlined some activities taking place during the month.

D. PROCLAMATION PROCLAIMING MAY 19, 2017, AS "ENDANGERED SPECIES DAY"

Councilwoman Mayfield read the proclamation proclaiming May 19, 2017, as "Endangered Species Day" in the City of Asheville. She presented the proclamation to Ms. Sue Massi - Volunteer with WNC Nature Center, Appalachian Wildlife Refuge, Wolf Conservation Center and the Endangered Species Coalition, who outlined some activities taking place during the day.

E. PROCLAMATION PROCLAIMING MAY 21-27, 2017, AS "NATIONAL PUBLIC WORKS WEEK"

Councilman Smith read the proclamation proclaiming May 21-27, 2017, as "National Public Works Week" in the City of Asheville. He presented the proclamation to Public Works Director Greg Shuler, Bryant Williams (Sanitation Division), Gary Reynolds (Streets Division), Justin Boll (Stormwater Division), Keisha Lipe (Administration) and Sarah Sheldon (GIS Team).

II. CONSENT AGENDA:

A. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING HELD ON APRIL 25, 2017

B. RESOLUTION NO. 17-78 - RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER TO EXECUTE A TERMINATION OF EASEMENT AGREEMENT FOR AN ABANDONED WATER LINE LOCATED AT 24 EDGEWOOD ROAD EAST

Summary: The consideration of a resolution authorizing the City Manager to execute a termination of easement agreement for an abandoned water line located at 24 Edgewood Road East.

The City's Water Resource Department has been working to abandon an existing 6-inch waterline that crossed under a house at 24 Edgewood Rd E (PIN No. 9658-86-7099). The owner of the property is in the process of trying to sell the house but the lending company would not close on the loan till the existing waterline was abandoned and the waterline easement terminated. The waterline is 1920's vintage and is no longer necessary for domestic or fire protection needs. The Water Resource Department has confirmed that the line has officially been cut and abandoned in place. The Termination of Easement Agreement relieves the City of Asheville from all liability associated with the easement and abandoned waterline at 24 Edgewood Road East.

In order to release the easement, City Council must authorize the City Manager to execute a termination of easement between the City and the current property owner, Carlton Wheeler.

Pros:

- Removes liability issues associated with waterline under a structure.
- This Termination of Easement aligns with the Main Waterline Study Assessment that identifies and addresses structures located over active water lines.

Con:

- None noted.

City staff recommends City Council approve a resolution authorizing the City Manager to execute a termination of easement agreement for an abandoned water line located at 24 Edgewood Road East.

RESOLUTION BOOK NO. 38 - PAGE 402

C. RESOLUTION NO. 17-79 - RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER TO CONVEY AN EASEMENT OVER A PORTION OF CITY-OWNED PROPERTY AT THE SHILOH PARK & COMMUNITY CENTER TO CATHERINE KINNARD FOR THE PURPOSE OF INSTALLING A SEWER LINE TO SERVICE A SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE

Summary: The consideration of a resolution authorizing the City Manager to convey an easement over a portion of City Owned property at the Shiloh Park & Community Center to Catherine Kinnard for the purpose of installing a sewer line to service a single family residence.

The Shiloh Park and Community Center is owned and maintained by the City of Asheville. An existing MSD sewer line runs northwest from Hampton Street and crosses the park. Several lateral lines already exist from homes on Kent Street and they have been allowed in the past with the stipulation that they do not interfere in the recreational activities. Catherine Kinnard owns an undeveloped lot on Kent Street and has reached out to the City to request a sewer line easement to connect to the existing line. This is the only available connection to the sewer line. Al Kopf of Parks and Recreation has been approached and after consulting with other staff in the Parks division, they have no objection to the easement. Ms. Kinnard plans to build a single family residence on the property and it will be her primary residence.

The easement being requested is approximately 25 linear feet long and 6 feet wide for a total square footage of approximately 150 square feet. Using comparable sales figures, the value per square foot of land in this neighborhood is roughly \$ 6.87 per square foot. MSD has a policy of compensating owners according to 50% of land value for an easement and when we apply this

to practice to this situation, the cost of the easement would be \$516.00 plus the real estate transaction fee.

Pros:

- There is compensation associated with the granting of this easement.
- The easement would not interfere with the recreational programming at Shiloh Park.

Con:

- None

Funds generated by the granting of this easement will be deposited in the General Fund.

Staff recommends City Council adopt a resolution authorizing the City Manager to convey this 150 square foot easement at Shiloh Park near Kent Street to Ms. Kinnard for purposes of installing a sewer service line.

RESOLUTION BOOK NO. 38 - PAGE 403

D. RESOLUTION NO. 17-80 - RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER TO ENTER INTO A CONTRACT WITH IPS GROUP INC. TO FURNISH PARKING METERS, AND PROVIDE ADMINISTRATIVE SUPPORT, IN THE CITY OF ASHEVILLE

Summary: The consideration of a resolution authorizing the City Manager to enter in a contract with IPS Group Inc. to furnish parking meters, and provide administration support, in the City of Asheville.

The City currently operates parking meters only in the Central Business District. The current inventory of parking meters, while quite old, has served the needs of the City quite well. They are of rugged construction, and with the exception of needing battery replacement several times a year, quite reliable. Heretofore, our policy has been to squeeze all the useful life out of the mechanisms to ensure the public received the best return on investment. But stretching the life of the mechanisms also brings challenges. The age of the meters makes it quite difficult to change rates, get reports, "train" for new coins, etc. Parking Service employees must go to each meter and insert a "prong" in to download or upload information in to the mechanism. This is a laborious process and in past rate increases, we had to purchase new mechanisms because the legacy mechanisms were so old the manufacturer didn't support them any longer.

The age of the meters also led to a declining of our ability to provide excellent customer service. Our use of double space meters (one meter serving two spaces) creates confusion among customers on which side to pay. This is also a challenge with pay-by-cell systems while selecting space numbers. While the existing meters are still quite capable of accepting nickels, dimes, and quarters, our customers' buying habits have changed. Rarely do customers carry pockets full of coins to activate the meters. And, as our meter rates have increased over the years, the need for more coins has grown.

To help ameliorate this need for more and more coins, the City entered in to a contract with Passport Parking to provide pay-by-cell service to pay for parking meters via credit or debit card. While quite successful for our customers, and the City, this pay-by-cell system does have some drawbacks. With the exception of 35 test meters, the time purchased does not display on the meter which can lead to some customer confusion. And, since time purchased via pay-by-cell, does not display on the meter, the Parking Enforcement Officer must query either their handheld ticket writer or smart phone to ascertain if the meter has been paid. Again a laborious process repeated many times a day. Despite these drawbacks, pay-by-cell has been a huge success for the City. And, we felt it was time to make a great leap forward in technology to better serve our customers.

In the spring of 2016, the City received 35 modern meters, from IPS Group, to test to determine if the system would be advantageous to our customers and staff. Key points we wanted to investigate were solar power, credit/debit card acceptance, ability to accept pay-by-cell information, ease of rate changes, reporting capability, data protection, etc. The test met all our parameters and expectations.

In February 2017, the City published a Request for Proposals, under the provisions of NCGS 143-129.8 for purchase of information goods and services, for interested firms to replace our existing inventory of existing parking meters with more modern ones. Parking Services wants to replace existing meters, and expand current meter coverage, over several years. Key requirements of the request for proposal were:

- Provide new solar powered “smart” meters connected, via cellular network, to the internet,
- Accept all United States issued nickels, dimes, and quarters,
- Accept credit and debit cards as payment options,
- Allow pay-by-cell information to be “pushed” to the meters and displayed thereon,
- All credit/debit card transactions must be PCI compliant to safeguard customer information,
- Provide “back office” administration, collection, and processing of payment information,
- Illumination feature for nighttime operations,
- Payment indicators visible from street,
- Provision for decorative sleeves and bases,
- Per unit pricing for single space units or double space units,
- Ability to purchase over several years as City needs expand,
- Provision of per month costs of “back office” administrative and data processing activities.

On March 24, 2017, the City received three proposals for providing new parking meters. Firms submitting were POM Meters (our existing vendor), IPS Group (test meter provider), and MacKay Meters. An inter-departmental team consisting of members from Information Technology Services, Transportation, and Parking Services evaluated each submittal. The team determined that the best solution for the City would be single space meters provided by IPS Group. While all proposals came in well below our planning figures, the initial outlay, per unit, for the IPS meters themselves is in the middle of the three proposals, will be slightly higher (7%) than the lowest and well below (10%) the highest quoted unit price. The advantages of the IPS system however makes it the clear choice.

Pros:

- Improves customer service by providing additional payment options.
- Improves customer’s ease with meters by eliminating confusion as to which space to pay for.
- Allows easier rate changes; to include variable pricing.
- Provides better statistical and financial reporting than current meters.
- More aesthetically pleasing with decorative sleeves and bases.
- PCI compliant to ensure customers’ data security.
- Provides capability to extend hours later in the evening
- Pay-by-cell information pushed to, and displayed, on the meter thereby providing better customer service.
- Single space meters make it easier to provide meter closures for businesses, trades workers, moving companies, etc. by allowing one space to be closed. Currently, with dual space meters, we have to close two spaces even if the requestor only wants one space. This results in the requestor paying for two spaces when only needing one, or the City losing revenue on one space because the payment devices are covered.

Cons:

- Some interruption of service as new meters are installed.
- Estimated expenditures of \$900K over three years.

Funds for the first year of replacements are available in the current Parking Services' Fund Operating Budget. Funding for the second year of purchases is included in the City Manager's Proposed 2017-18 Budget.

City staff recommends City Council adopt a resolution authorizing the City Manager to execute an initial three year term contract not to exceed \$900,000 with IPS Group Inc. to furnish parking meters and provide administration support; and the option to extend the term of the contract for up to an additional three years to an amount in the approved budget. Also, further authorized to execute any change order to said contract which might arise during the time period of the contract up to the budgeted amount.

RESOLUTION BOOK NO. 38 - PAGE 404

E. RESOLUTION NO. 17-81 - RESOLUTION MAKING PROVISIONS FOR THE POSSESSION AND CONSUMPTION OF MALT BEVERAGES AND/OR UNFORTIFIED WINE AT THE ACSC GAMES

RESOLUTION NO. 17-82 - RESOLUTION MAKING PROVISIONS FOR THE POSSESSION AND CONSUMPTION OF MALT BEVERAGES AND/OR UNFORTIFIED WINE AT THE BEER CITY FESTIVAL

RESOLUTION NO. 17-83 - RESOLUTION MAKING PROVISIONS FOR THE POSSESSION AND CONSUMPTION OF MALT BEVERAGES AND/OR UNFORTIFIED WINE AT DOWNTOWN AFTER FIVE EVENTS

RESOLUTION NO. 17-84 - RESOLUTION MAKING PROVISIONS FOR THE POSSESSION AND CONSUMPTION OF MALT BEVERAGES AND/OR UNFORTIFIED WINE AT BREWS & BEARS

RESOLUTION NO. 17-85 - RESOLUTION MAKING PROVISIONS FOR THE POSSESSION AND CONSUMPTION OF MALT BEVERAGES AND/OR UNFORTIFIED WINE AT THE ASHEVILLE WINE & FOOD FESTIVAL

RESOLUTION NO. 17-86 - RESOLUTION MAKING PROVISIONS FOR THE POSSESSION AND CONSUMPTION OF MALT BEVERAGES AND/OR UNFORTIFIED WINE AT THE ASHEVILLE RUNNING EXPERIENCE

Summary: The consideration of resolutions making provisions for the possession and consumption of malt beverages and/or unfortified wine at the ACSC Games, Downtown After 5, the Beer City Festival, Brews & Bears, the Asheville Wine & Food Festival, and the Asheville Running Experience.

- The Asheville Brewers Alliance has requested through the City of Asheville Community & Economic Development Department that City Council permit them to serve beer and/or unfortified wine at the ACSC Games and at the Beer City Festival, and allow for consumption at the events.

The ACSC Games will be held on Wednesday, May 17, Friday, May 19, Thursday, June 8, Tuesday, Saturday, June 17, June 20, Saturday, July 1, and Saturday, July 8, 2017 from 6:00 p.m. – 10:00 p.m. within the boundaries of Memorial Stadium as per the area limits referenced on the accompanying site map.

The Beer City Festival will be held on Saturday, May 27, 2017 from 12:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m. within the boundaries of Pack Square Park as per the area limits referenced on the accompanying site map.

- The Asheville Downtown Association has requested through the City of Asheville Community & Economic Development Department that City Council permit them to serve beer and/or unfortified wine at Downtown After 5 and allow for consumption at the event.

Downtown After 5 will be held on Fridays, May 19, June 16, July 21, August 18, and September 15, 2017 from 5:00 p.m. – 10:00 p.m. within the boundaries of Lexington Avenue as per the area limits referenced on the accompanying site map.

- The Friends of the WNC Nature Center has requested through the City of Asheville Community & Economic Development Department that City Council permit them to serve beer and/or unfortified wine at Brews & Bears and allow for consumption at the event.

Brews & Bears will be held on Friday, July 21, 2017 from 4:00 p.m. – 9:00 p.m. within the boundaries of the WNC Nature Center as per the area limits referenced on the accompanying site map.

- Slow Food Asheville has requested through the City of Asheville Community & Economic Development Department that City Council permit them to serve beer and/or unfortified wine at the Asheville Wine & Food Festival and allow for consumption at the event.

The Asheville Wine & Food Festival will be held on Friday, August 18 and Saturday, August 19, 2017 from 1:00 p.m. – 6:00 p.m. within the boundaries of Pack Square Park as per the area limits referenced on the accompanying site map.

- The Blue Ridge Roller Derby has requested through the City of Asheville Community & Economic Development Department that City Council permit them to serve beer and/or unfortified wine at the Asheville Running Experience and allow for consumption at the event.

The Asheville Running Experience will be held on Saturday, September 23 from 5:00 a.m. – 9:00 p.m. within the boundaries of Coxe Avenue as per the area limits referenced on the accompanying site map.

Pro:

- Allows fundraising opportunities for Asheville Brewers Alliance, the Asheville Downtown Association, Friends of the WNC Nature Center, Slow Food Asheville, and the Blue Ridge Roller Derby

Con:

- Potential for public safety issues

Staff recommends City Council adopt resolutions authorizing the City Manager to approve resolutions making provisions for the possession and consumption of malt beverages and/or unfortified wine at the ACSC Games, Beer City Festival, Downtown After 5, Brews & Bears, Asheville Wine & Food Festival, and Asheville Running Experience.

RESOLUTION NO. 17-81 - RESOLUTION BOOK NO. 38 - PAGE 405

RESOLUTION NO. 17-82 - RESOLUTION BOOK NO. 38 - PAGE 408
RESOLUTION NO. 17-83 - RESOLUTION BOOK NO. 38 - PAGE 411
RESOLUTION NO. 17-84 - RESOLUTION BOOK NO. 38 - PAGE 414
RESOLUTION NO. 17-85 - RESOLUTION BOOK NO. 38 - PAGE 417
RESOLUTION NO. 17-86 - RESOLUTION BOOK NO. 38 - PAGE 240

**F. RESOLUTION NO. 17-87 - RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE CITY
MANAGER TO ACCEPT A GRANT FROM THE N.C. DEPT. OF
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY FOR A COMMUNITY WASTE REDUCTION AND
RECYCLING GRANT**

**ORDINANCE NO. 4580 - BUDGET AMENDMENT FOR A COMMUNITY
WASTE REDUCTION AND RECYCLING GRANT**

Summary: The consideration of a resolution authorizing the City Manager to accept Community Waste Reduction and Recycling (CWRAR) grant funds from the N.C. Dept. of Environmental Quality (NCDEQ); and a budget amendment in the amount of \$28,301 in the Special Revenue Fund to budget the grant and the City's match.

In October 2015, the City of Asheville partnered with the Housing Authority of the City of Asheville (HACA) to launch a recycling pilot project for the 280 public housing units of the Erskine, Walton and Livingston Street communities. With CWRAR funding from NCDEQ, "Big Blue" 96-gallon recycling roll carts were distributed to each residence and significant outreach was conducted. In 2016 City was awarded a second grant, Phase II, to expand this recycling project to 388 more units in the communities of Deaverview and Hillcrest in FY17. Participating communities are now collectively recycling over 5,000 pounds of materials every week.

Phase III of the CWRAR grant expands recycling collection to the Pisgah View community, which is an additional 256 households, in the hopes that continued success will lead to curbside recycling collection for all applicable low-rise public housing communities.

In addition to expanding curbside recycling services in public housing, the FY18 CWRAR Grant includes composting at the US Cellular Center (USCC). In order to help achieve greater waste reduction, the City plans to implement a composting program at the USCC, Asheville's largest event space, starting with the Thomas Wolfe Auditorium. The Thomas Wolfe Auditorium hosts an average of 85 events each year, which generates an average of 26 tons of waste. This grant supports projects that demonstrate potential to significantly reduce a community's overall diversion of materials from the solid waste stream. The Office of Sustainability believes that Phase I, composting in Thomas Wolfe, has the potential to divert around 11 tons of waste annually from the USCC.

The total cost for the pilot project is \$28,301. The CWRAR grant would require a 30% cash match from the City of Asheville. Thus \$8,784 would be contributed by the City, from the sustainability street light savings in the general fund, while the grant would cover the remaining \$19,517.

On April 25, 2017, the Finance Committee reviewed this action and unanimously recommended it move forward to the full Council.

Pros:

- Provides more equitable access to recycling services for residents of public housing
- Helps to meet City's waste reduction goal while leveraging state funding

Con:

- None can be identified

As noted above the total cost of the project is \$28,301 with the grant covering \$19,517 or 70% of the cost. The 30% City match of \$8,784 will come from sustainability street light savings that have been designated for green projects.

City staff recommends City Council adopt a resolution authorizing the City Manager to accept \$19,517 in grant monies from NCDENR; and a budget amendment in the amount of \$28,301 in the Special Revenue Fund to budget the grant and the City's match.

**RESOLUTION BOOK NO. 38 - PAGE 423
ORDINANCE BOOK NO. 31 - PAGE 190**

G. RESOLUTION NO. 17-88 - RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT/APPROVE A LICENSE AGREEMENT WITH USCOC OF GREATER NORTH CAROLINA LLC (D/B/A US CELLULAR) FOR ANTENNAS AT 166 RESERVOIR ROAD, DIRECTING THE CITY CLERK TO ADVERTISE FOR UPSET BIDS, AND AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER TO EXECUTE THE LICENSE AGREEMENT IS NO ALTERNATE BIDS ARE RECEIVED

Summary: The consideration of a Resolution proposing to accept/approve a license agreement with USCOC of Greater North Carolina, LLC (DBA US Cellular) for antennas at 166 Reservoir Road, directing the City Clerk to advertise for upset bids, and authorizing the City Manager to execute the license agreement if no alternate bids are received.

The property at 166 Reservoir Road, known as White Fawn Reservoir, is on a knoll at the western end of the Beaucatcher Mountain ridge. It has exceptional range for telecommunication with approximately 300° coverage from northeast to west to southeast. Two telecommunication towers are located on the property and the City of Asheville leases antenna space on the towers and ground space for telecom equipment.

This property has also been considered for a future park area. The Beaucatcher Greenway was designed to terminate at this property to offer expansive views of Downtown Asheville. A community group, known as the Friends of Overlook Park, established an agreement with the City to begin the vision and master plan process for recreational use of the property. Existing conditions, including the presence of two telecommunications towers and an abandoned and filled reservoir are acknowledged as part of the site constraints of the design.

US Cellular has been a tenant on the upper tower for a number of years and their current license agreement with the City expires in 2019. As part of the prior agreement, US Cell agreed to provide in-kind services to benefit the City's public safety communications infrastructure. Specifically, US Cell provides a conditioned telco room for the City's public safety communications equipment at this location, access to US Cellular's backup generator and electrical service to the site.

US Cellular has approached the City requesting that a new license agreement be negotiated before the existing lease expires because of the importance of this site to their overall operations in the Greater Asheville area. The following terms have been set forth, as follows:

- US Cellular has requested a ten year term with two optional renewals for four years each. The total would be 18 years.
- US Cellular has agreed to a rate of \$55,032 per year with 3.5% annual increases.
- The City has verified that this rate is consistent with municipal tower rates across North Carolina and is considered fair market value.
- If approved, the existing license agreement would terminate upon execution of a new license agreement.
- US Cellular will continue to provide in-kind services to the City as part of the agreement.

Since the license agreement proposal is for a total period longer than ten (10) years, the North Carolina General Statutes state that Council may authorize a lease longer than ten (10) years, but to do so the lease must be administered as a sale in that the process must include an upset bid process or other competitive bid process.

If City Council approves the following resolution, the City Clerk will be directed to publish an advertisement for upset bids for a period of 10 days, in which any interested party may upset the current bid of \$55,032 per year at 3.5 % annual increases over an 18 year term. The statutes require that a qualifying bid must increase the current offer by 10% of the first \$1,000 and 5% of the remainder. As set forth in the resolution, if no qualifying upset bids are received, then City Council agrees to further authorize the City Manager to execute the license agreement with US Cellular.

Pros:

- Fair market value license agreement.
- Long term commitment from US Cellular will secure a future revenue stream for the City.
- In-kind services benefit the City's public safety communications.

Con:

- None noted.

License fee revenue is budgeted in the City's General Fund Operating budget. The revenue for this license agreement will be programmed in the annual operating budget for FY 2018.

Staff recommends City Council adopt the following resolution proposing to accept/approve a license agreement with USCOC of Greater North Carolina, LLC (dba US Cellular) for antennas, equipment and expanded buildings at 166 Reservoir Road, directing the City Clerk to advertise for upset bids, and authorizing the City Manager to execute the license agreement if no alternate bids are received.

RESOLUTION BOOK NO. 38 - PAGE 424

Mayor Manheimer asked for public comments on any item on the Consent Agenda, but received none.

Mayor Manheimer said that members of Council have been previously furnished with a copy of the resolutions and ordinances on the Consent Agenda and they would not be read.

Councilman Bothwell moved for the adoption of the Consent Agenda. This motion was seconded by Councilman Young and carried unanimously.

III. PRESENTATIONS & REPORTS:

A. BUDGET PRESENTATION

Finance and Management Services Director Barbara Whitehorn provided Council the revenue neutral calculation with the latest estimate being 39.39-cents. The total proposed property tax rate arrived at (1) revenue neutral - 39.5-cents (39.39-cents); (2) debt service on General Obligation Bonds - 3.5-cents; (3) transit funding - .05-cents; (4) proposed rate - 43.5-cents (4-cents lower than our current rate). She then provided information on the base budget, which she noted the budgeted operating costs reduced year-over-year is \$138,000.

She outlined the Fund Balance with Fund Balance above policy minimum is \$1,690,662. Out of that Fund Balance with direction from Council is as follows: Energy Innovation Task Force - \$205,000; Tree Canopy Study \$25,000; Payroll/Benefits Audit Recommendations - \$200,000; Accident Replacement Fire Truck - \$510,000; Police Staffing Vehicles - \$384,000; Election Costs - \$275,000; Additional Strategic Partnership Funding - \$42,000; and Neighborhood Fund - \$50,000. This leaves the Fund Balance above policy minimum being \$338.

She said the 2017-18 proposed General Fund Budget is \$121,184,489. She then reviewed the existing Capital Improvement Project and 2016 General Obligation Bond Programs. She then briefly reviewed the other fund budgets - Water Resources, Parking Services, Stormwater, U.S. Cellular Center, and Transit Services.

The 2017-18 Proposed Operating Budget is \$174,900,890. Uncontrollable budget variables between now and budget adoption include (1) economic downturn (a) uncertainty in global market; and (b) consumer spending decrease; (2) legislative climate (a) Sales Tax Bill - SB 126 - reduces sales tax distribution to Asheville by \$1.1 Million; and (3) bottom line reductions (a) lower Fund Balance would call for reduction in allocations; and (b) reduction in on-going revenue would call for service cuts or tax increase.

At the request of Councilman Smith, Ms. Whitehorn explained the current sales tax distribution formula, noting that out of every dollar spent, the City only realizes 3-cents. The sales tax distribution bill will have a big impact on the City of Asheville.

City Manager Jackson said that we have deliberately and intentionally positioned ourselves to absorb budget crunches for those type of actions with the rainy-day funds that we have. Our reserves are in good shape and are right in the financial management criteria that this Council has set. We have quarterly reporting and close watch on all operations of the City. As we present this budget, we try to be aware of what the risks are and move forward on a sound financial basis.

Mayor Manheimer said that people who own property in Asheville are struggling with their new tax valuation figures and are wondering what the impact will be on their tax bill. We have landed in a place where we have built in the 3.5 cents for the General Obligation bonds because the voters approved the bonds. We went to revenue neutral with the additional 3.5 cents for the bonds. But, she continues to have concern over the additional ½ cent for transit; however, she knows that this Council is committed to growing our transit program to reflect enhancements, which roughly come out to approximately \$600,000. She personally asked the City Manager to look at a budget that does not raise taxes beyond the bond requirement, but that does incorporate the additional ½ cent transit funding.

Councilman Bothwell wondered if delaying the roll-out of the APD Downtown District could account for the ½ cent for transit. He also said Council might consider a slight reduction in the City contribution to the Affordable Housing Trust Fund because we do have the bond issue for affordable housing. He also supported revenue neutral plus the 3.5 cents for the bonds.

Councilwoman Mayfield still supported the ½ cent transit funding with a tax increase. Regarding the Affordable Housing Trust Fund, she discovered that we can't use bond funds for the low-income weatherization program recommended by the Energy Innovation Task Force, so it may have to come out of the General Fund allocation for the Affordable Housing Trust Fund.

Mayor Manheimer said that Council can give some broad direction to the City Manager and have him make suggestions on how to allocate the funds.

Councilwoman Mayfield noted that the proposal to change the way that we structure our contract with the transit management company is estimated to be \$850,000. She knew the number would be high, but she didn't know it would be that much. She understood there is an

RFP out, but wondered if we can look at the cost analysis and if we have \$850,000 to spend on transit, do we want to spend it on a different structure of a management system or expand services. City Manager Jackson said that if Council has specific areas that you want him to look at to find \$850,000, he would appreciate the general direction. He will come back on May 23 with alternative scenarios.

Councilman Young agreed with Mayor Manheimer if we can be revenue neutral with the 3.5 cents for bonds. He suggested possibly delaying the public safety allocation.

Mayor Manheimer clarified that we still want to make a commitment to public safety growth, but it may be delayed in order to find additional funds for this year. She again, would not want to see an increase in taxes beyond the bond commitment.

Councilwoman Mayfield said that the overall increase in transit funding is approximately 3-cents. She asked that we explore a 3-cent dedicated source of funding for transit since we are going to need that if we are going to get to the transit system we need. As the value of our property grows, the value of that 3-cents will grow as well giving us a continuous increase in transit funding over time. She asked for some projections of what a 3-cent increase this year might be over time.

Councilman Smith supported continuing to grow our transit system and liked the idea of a dedicated source of funding for transit. He felt affordable housing crisis is real and we should not be raiding the bond money for the Affordable Housing Trust Fund. He, too, would like to keep the taxes at revenue neutral plus 3.5-cents for the bonds. He supported ensuring the community development needs of our community are being recognized and met and supported increasing the Strategic Partnership Funds in the coming year over and above what we are doing currently. He also remained supportive of the Asheville Police Department and further restructuring at a logistical level.

Councilman Haynes did not support funding the increase in Police Department staffing. He supported seeing the transit system fully funded and an increase for the Strategic Partnership Fund. He, too, agreed for a revenue neutral tax with the 3.5-cents for bonds.

City Manager Jackson said that any additional questions from Council tonight and up to the May 23 meeting will go into a comprehensive response included with the May 23 agenda. He said that he will present an option for no tax increase, noting that 85 position requests and \$11 Million have not been funded. He said that he anticipated that Council might want to go to revenue neutral and has begun looking at options.

Mayor Manheimer said that the budget public hearing will be held on May 23, 2017, with the final adoption of the budget on June 13, 2017.

B. ASHEVILLE POLICE DEPARTMENT REPORT ON TRAFFIC STOPS AND SEARCH DATA

Deputy Chief Wade Wood said that Police Chief Hooper had a long-standing commitment supporting the National Law Enforcement Week efforts in Washington, D.C., and was unable to attend this meeting. He then summarized the following Chief Hooper's report:

"During its April 25, 2017 Regular Meeting, City Council received a presentation from Attorney Ian Mance of the Southern Coalition for Social Justice regarding his analysis of traffic stop data reported by the Asheville Police Department (APD) over a 15 year period from the website opendatapolicing.com. From this analysis, Mr. Mance made the following recommendations:

- Scrutinize and address APD's data reporting practices to ensure compliance with North Carolina General Statute (NCGS) §143B-903 entitled Collection of law enforcement statistics.
- Prohibit or de-emphasize regulatory and equipment-based stops.
- Institute a mandatory written consent-to-search policy.
- Order periodic audits of individual officer stop-and-search data.

Following a question and answer period between the City Council and Mr. Mance, the City Council requested that the APD analyze the data presented and evaluate Mr. Mance's recommendations. The City Council requested that an interim or full report be provided at the May 9, 2017 Regular Meeting of City Council.

The purpose of this report is to provide a response to the findings and recommendations by Mr. Mance, and to outline the ongoing progressive initiatives underway within the APD to continue moving it towards a model twenty-first century Police Department.

BACKGROUND AND ANALYSIS

The information in the opendatapolicing.com report was first brought to the attention of the APD during a November 30, 2016 meeting with Ms. Dee Williams and Mr. Patrick Conant. During the meeting, Ms. Williams and Mr. Conant indicated that Mr. Mance would be coming to a Lunch and Learn event organized by Ms. Williams to discuss the information. During that meeting, a copy of the report was not provided to APD. Assistant City Manager Paul Fetherston requested that Ms. Williams and Mr. Conant meet with staff prior to the event to discuss their findings and they agreed.

On January 11, 2017, a follow up meeting occurred at the Eddington Center in which Mr. Mance was present and discussed his findings and recommendations. Over the following several months, the report was presented at the Lunch and Learn event, at the February meeting of CPAC, and to the Public Safety Committee in March, which directed that the presentation be given to Council.

Since becoming aware of the report, APD staff has been looking into the data as well as surveying other agencies referenced in the report to verify the validity of the conclusions as well as determine the department's direction regarding the policy recommendations.

Compliance

One of the primary assertions by Mr. Mance is that APD has not had an acceptable level of compliance to the reporting requirements in NCGS §143B-903. To demonstrate this, he asserted that he pulled 50 random traffic citations to determine if the stops had been reported as required and stated that 58% were not in the SBI database.

Since July 2016, APD has conducted monthly compliance audits of traffic stop reports and at no time have such audits found any data whatsoever that is consistent with Mr. Mance's assertion. Since starting monthly compliance audits, the APD's average compliance rate when comparing traffic stop reports to documented traffic stops in APD's Records Management System (RMS) is 102% (if more than one vehicle is pulled over during a traffic post, it generates a separate traffic stop report). Even when the APD examines its Computer Aided Dispatch data (CAD) and adds additional calls that *could but do not necessarily* require a traffic stop report such as "crime prevention" where a suspicious vehicle is encountered etc., the average compliance is 85%.

To address this inconsistency, the APD asked Mr. Mance for the list of citations on which he based his assertion. Mr. Mance, who declined to provide them, responded via email stating, in part, the following:

Just to be clear, I have not asserted that we pulled a random representative sample, nor did I say that the under-reporting rate I found in the cases I looked at reflected the under-reporting rate for the whole department.

Another frequent example where compliance is questioned for a time period prior to APD's monthly audits is the data submitted for 2015. Mr. Mance asserts that it is improbable that Asheville had only 7409 traffic stop reports in 2015, when other similarly sized cities in North Carolina had far more such as Concord, which reported 21,000.

When examining this information, APD contacted Concord and determined that traffic enforcement is a high priority for their agency, since the city lies on the northern border of Charlotte and experiences a high volume of commuter traffic on I-85 and other alternate routes into the city. The following compares call volume and crime in 2015:

| 2015 | Calls Dispatched | Part I Violent Crime | Part I Non-Violent Crime | Total Part I Crime | Total Part II Crime |
|------------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------------------|--------------------|---------------------|
| Asheville | 114,954 | 444 | 4,257 | 4,701 | 5,019 |
| Concord | 87,475 | 120 | 2,599 | 2,719 | 2,056 |

Based on crime and call load, officers in Concord have far more time to conduct traffic enforcement and other discretionary duties. Further, Concord did not experience the more than 10 million estimated visitors that Asheville had in 2015. Although similarly sized, Concord may not be a valid comparator.

Nonetheless, it is important to ask - is 7409 reported stops in 2015 a drastic reduction compared to previous years and if so, why? To answer this, it is appropriate to look at the number of stops APD reported to the SBI database in 2015 compared to the number of stops listed in their database. This revealed an anomaly in the listed stops in the SBI database for the months of February and August 2015.

| 2015 Traffic Stop Data | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
|-------------------------------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-------|
| Stops Reported by APD to SBI | 710 | 691 | 827 | 763 | 765 | 635 | 824 | 622 | 723 | 781 | 744 | 635 | 8719 |
| Stops Listed in SBI Database | 710 | 9 | 827 | 763 | 761 | 633 | 823 | 2 | 723 | 781 | 743 | 634 | 7409 |

The uploading of traffic stop data to the SBI database is an entirely automated process. A disclaimer on its site explains that a small variance is not unusual, however, APD reported more than 1300 traffic stops in those two months that do not appear in their database. It is unclear why this occurred and there have been no subsequent similar anomalies.

Further, it is well documented that APD did not have use of speed measuring devices (Radar or Lidar) for a period of time due to issues with calibrations. All speed measuring devices were pulled out of service in October 2014. APD did not receive clearance from North Carolina Training and Standards to return them to service until September 2015, and even after that, most of the officers who use them required re-certification. This resulted in little to no use of these instruments during the entirety of 2015 causing a substantial reduction in speeding violations.

Finally, when looking at the overall number of traffic stops reported over the past several years, there has been a general year to year reduction. The last year in which more than 10,000 stops were reported was 2012 with declining totals for 2013-2016 of 7918, 7460, 8719, and 6512 respectively.

Based on this research, there is no evidence that APD has been largely non-compliant in reporting traffic stops during 2015 or 2016. APD will continue to monitor this through monthly compliance audits through our Professional Standards Section.

Policy Recommendations by Jurisdiction

| | Prohibits Regulatory Stops | Requires Written Consent | Has BWC Program | Audits |
|---------------------|-----------------------------------|---------------------------------|--------------------------------------|---------------------------|
| Asheville | No | No – BWC required | Yes – Full implementation by June 30 | Monthly Compliance Audits |
| Greensboro | No | No – BWC Required | Yes | Quarterly Audits |
| Fayetteville | No | Yes-but low priority w/BWC | Yes | Quarterly Audits |
| Durham | No | Yes | Yes – currently 20% implemented | Quarterly Audits |
| Chapel Hill | No | Yes | No-Testing phase | Quarterly Audits |

Regulatory Stops

In his presentation, Mr. Mance stated that regulatory and equipment based traffic stops disproportionately impact black motorists in Asheville and reported that an analysis of stops beginning in 2011 revealed that 40% of black motorists were stopped for these violations compared to 32% of white motorists. APD does not dispute these calculations. The reasons why drivers, regardless of race, chose to operate vehicles that are not properly registered, have defective equipment issues, or other regulatory concerns is debatable, but it stands to reason that a substantial portion of these violations are the result of the inability of people in lower income circumstances to afford to keep their vehicle in compliance with these laws. As such, these stops necessarily have a disparate impact on African American drivers.

APD officers will not be prohibited from conducting lawfully permitted traffic stops for regulatory or equipment violations. At the same time, these violations are not, and have not been a priority for APD and will not be emphasized as such. This is consistent with the practices of other agencies mentioned by Mr. Mance in his report as shown above. Further, in February 2017, APD officers were directed in instances where a traffic stop for regulatory or equipment violations does occur, to issue warnings rather than tickets for minor regulatory and equipment violations whenever feasible, particularly if it's the first time a vehicle is stopped for this reason. The purpose of this is to minimize the financial impact on people who already struggle financially, an issue that was brought up as a primary concern to members of the Racial Justice Coalition during a February 23, 2017, meeting with Chief Hooper in which Mr. Mance's report was discussed. This direction was subsequently relayed to members of the Racial Justice Coalition at a follow up meeting on April 28, 2017.

Consent Searches

Mr. Mance reported that there has been a significant reduction in the city-wide stop and search rate "in recent years." He further stated that 56% of all searches over the last five years are consent searches, pointing out that this is a higher percentage than many other departments in the state.

Mr. Mance is correct that the search rate has reduced. The data suggests that the reduction in the number of searches for all reasons has continued a downward trend beginning in 2013 and continuing through 2016 as compared to the period of 2010 through 2012. In addition, the total number of stops has also decreased as discussed above.

| | Total Stops | % Searched for any reason | % Consent Searches |
|-----------------------|--------------------|----------------------------------|---------------------------|
| 2010-2012 | 35,171 | 8% | 5% |
| 2013-2016 | 28,885 | 4% | 1.5% |
| ONLY 2015-2016 | 13,726 | 3% | 1% |

In the period of 2010-2012, the number of consent searches actually exceeded the number of other searches, equating to approximately 59% of all searches. This represents an unusually high percentage of consent searches, for which Mr. Mance's concerns are well taken. However, in the four years following, 2013-2016, the number of consent searches equate to about 39% of all searches. Looking only at the last two years, 2015-2016, consent searches equate to 34% of all searches. Still a high percentage, but continuing to trend downward.

There is no specific provable explanation for the reduction. Over the past several years, all APD officers have received training specific to implicit bias as well as other racial sensitivity training which may be a factor in the reduction. Further, since July 2015 APD has been steadily gaining momentum in incorporating 21st Century Policing practices with a focus on procedural justice and community engagement.

The issuance of body worn cameras is a substantial step forward in ensuring that drivers are being treated in a fair and constitutional manner during all stops. The legal test for consent is that it is given freely and voluntarily. In most cases, written consent is preferred over verbal consent as an extra means to ensure this. However, the recording of an entire interaction via body worn camera video is even more certain documented evidence as to whether or not the consent is obtained in a lawful and constitutional manner. APD's policy on Body Worn Camera

use ensures that this information is captured and provides a means to not only test the constitutionality of consent, but to ensure that the request for consent is based on reasonable suspicion and not being disparately applied.

Audits

There is no dispute that audits of the traffic stop data are an important component of proper oversight. Recognizing this, APD began conducting internal compliance audits in July 2016, well before this report was presented by Mr. Mance. In addition to checking the level of compliance, APD will implement quarterly audits comparing the opendatapolicing.com information to APD's internal data to ensure consistency as well as to determine if there are trends regarding disparate treatment and impacts on African Americans citizens in our city.

Conclusion

The APD welcomes the opportunity to examine its practices and procedures to ensure that they are consistent with our goal of addressing crime, violence, and quality of life issues through modern, evidence based strategies integrated with the principles of community policing. The history of disparate and racist treatment of African Americans, including in our own community, must be acknowledged. Reports such as the one presented by Mr. Mance bring examples of this to light that can be specifically addressed and corrected. APD will accomplish this by minimizing the financial impact of regulatory and equipment violations through the issuance of warnings in lieu of citations, requiring body worn camera recordings of all vehicle searches, continuing monthly compliance audits and conducting quarterly audits of opendatapolicing.com data.

APD continues to work toward incorporating 21st Century policing principles and has already made substantial progress through the following initiatives:

- implementation of a body worn camera program,
- incorporating community input in its Use of Force Policy revision,
- ensuring all officers are trained in de-escalation, implicit bias, cultural sensitivity, crisis intervention and more, and
- continuing to develop and nurture partnerships, build trust, and instill confidence in its ability to maximize the community's quality of life by providing a high performing law enforcement services.

Through incorporation of the practices listed above, APD will gain further momentum toward becoming a model department."

Councilman Bothwell noted a correction in the report from Police Chief Hooper it asserts that Mr. Mance did not provide the list of citations to the Police Department. However, Mr. Mance did, but the Police Department missed the e-mail and discovered it later.

When Vice-Mayor Wisler asked if warnings for regulatory stops will be documented, Deputy Chief Wood said yes.

Vice-Mayor Wisler asked if there was research that documents whether a written consent may or may not be more effective than verbal. She wondered if we move to 100% written consent, would the officer have to explain it. Or, if someone was illiterate or intimidated by legal language or by the officer, a written consent may have the opposite effect than intended. Deputy Chief Wood said there are multiple studies and he would provide that information to Council.

Vice-Mayor Wisler suggested the Asheville Police Department (APD) look into publishing the results of the audits regarding body cam footages.

Councilwoman Mayfield wanted to see the APD and the community succeed in addressing these issues. One key way to do that is when we all work from the same set of data. Making that data available on a more frequent basis in an aggregated format is the only way we will work from a common piece of information. She hoped the community will get around the table to solve these issues and regular frequent reporting will help us see where we are and where we need to go.

Mayor Manheimer noted that our Information Technology Department is currently working on an open data piece around this issue.

Councilman Bothwell has heard that a written consent form is more likely to inform the driver that they can refuse to consent. When there is a verbal request, he wondered if the officer advises the driver that they don't have to consent. Deputy Chief Wood said that is officer dependent. He said ideally you are soliciting the consent to search and again the legal test for consent is that it is given freely and voluntarily.

Councilman Young said there is a tremendous degree of expectations that are placed on our police officers; however, there is a public perception that historically it seems as though police in and around the country are the only institutions that are above reproach. The public does not always see things the way the law enforcement community does and as public servants we need to be cognizant of what the public's perception is. Regarding the uploading of the traffic stop data to the SBI database, we are told it is completely an automated process. As seen in the 2015 data in February and August, he was concerned by the Asheville Police Department (APD) did not find out why their reports were not recorded by the SBI data. When we start the monthly check, we need to make sure that our stops are being recorded. Regarding regulatory and equipment based traffic stops disproportionately impact black motorists in Asheville, the APD feels that it's because of the inability of people in lower income circumstances can't afford to keep their vehicles in compliance, and as such these stops necessarily have a disparate impact on African American drivers. To accept this premise, since African Americans only make up a small percentage of individuals in the City, he questioned where are the poor white drivers in Asheville. Regarding consent, he recommended that the APD make written consents mandatory. He strongly felt that written consent searches benefit the individual that is being pulled over to know for a fact that the officer cannot search their car without their consent.

Mayor Manheimer asked for clarification on the percentages for regulatory stop data.

At the request of Mayor Manheimer, it was the consensus of Council to receive written quarterly audits.

Councilwoman Mayfield said that as cities progress to body worn cameras that written consent seems to be decreasing. It makes sense that the body worn cameras would provide the best evidence of consent and lack of bullying and provide the best check on the officer's behavior.

Deputy Chief Wood said that a body worn camera provides a picture of full interaction of all parties involved; however, only the Police Chief and parties involved (with their attorneys) can view the body cam footage, according to state law.

When Councilman Smith asked City Attorney Currin if the confidential memorandum regarding traffic stops and consent searches that she provided to Council is open to be released, City Attorney Currin said that Legal staff will remove any attorney-client privilege information and make the data contained therein available to the public.

Mayor Manheimer felt the written consent search has a lot of benefit but if you don't have the video to back it up, there might be some discrepancy on how that consent was obtained. She would assume a video would trump a written consent on determining whether or not there was consent provided for the search. Not having expertise in policing, she has to defer to the APD if they feel the camera consent is better than written consent she will have to go with that recommendation. She did feel it would be helpful for Council to have a 6-month follow-up to look at the number of consent searches vs. the number of probable cause searches and how those consent searches were documented.

Mayor Manheimer said that she has never seen the written consent form so she didn't know if it advises the driver that they have the option to say no or not. She said that would be an interesting thing to look at.

Councilman Haynes supported mandatory written consents.

City Manager Jackson summarized the following additional information Council has requested: (1) are there independent studies of written consent effectiveness and advice on recommended practices; (2) response to SBI data questions raised; (3) is it possible to compile aggregate data of performance audits and make available as open records and quarterly reports to Council; and (4) what is the APD plan for creating other key disparity metrics.

C. UPDATE ON FOOD ACTION POLICY PLAN

Assistant City Manager Cathy Ball provided Council with the following report by Sustainability Officer Amber Weaver:

"The purpose of this status report from the Office of Sustainability (OoS) is to provide City Council an update on the Asheville Edibles Program and the revision of the City's Food Policy Action Plan.

On January 22, 2013, Asheville City Council passed a resolution establishing the City of Asheville's Food Action Plan in support of the Asheville Buncombe Food Policy agenda. The Food Policy Action Plan included 14 specific areas to review or take action on to support the shared goals of the City of Asheville and the Asheville Buncombe Food Policy Council.

The Food Policy Action Plan Website and Programming project charter (March 2016) described an aim to provide "programming that supports the City's Food Policy Action Plan and the measures within the plan that address; specifically, urban agriculture through farmer's markets, local food purchasing policies, public private partnerships for composting, edible native landscaping, native pollinator plants that support Bee City USA resolution, food production, and education to the community at large."

The Asheville Edibles program has been developed to meet this need and includes processes for community gardens, Adopt-A-Spot, and large agriculture leases. The program debuted at the 2017 Earth Day celebration.

Update:

Asheville Edibles Program:

The purpose of this program is to provide an opportunity for community members to grow food and pollinator plants on publicly-owned land; goals identified in both Resolution 13-17 Food Policy Action Plan and the designation of Asheville as the inaugural Bee City USA, Resolution 12-

153. New this year, the City of Asheville is partnering with Asheville GreenWorks to expand Bee City and pollinator projects through Adopt-A-Spot.

The Asheville Edibles Program consists of three different opportunities: Adopt-A-Spot, Community Gardens, and Urban Agriculture Leases.

Adopt-A-Spot - The City has teamed up with Asheville GreenWorks to provide oversight of the new Adopt-A-Spot program. Businesses, organizations, or individuals can apply to adopt a City-owned piece of property. Once an application is approved, the responsibility of the adopter will be to maintain either an edible or pollinator garden in the location. Adopters will be recognized with a sign at the adopted spot.

Community Gardens - Asheville's Community Gardens Program provides residents with an opportunity to organize community gardens on designated City-owned land. For the 2017 growing season, four (4) sites have been identified by city staff. For successful applicants, there is no cost to lease the land, and each garden location has room for several plots. This is a great way to bring a neighborhood and/or organization together to grow local, fresh, and healthy produce to create a stronger, more resilient community.

Urban Agriculture Leases - The Urban Agriculture Leases Program has parcels of City-owned land prepared to be leased at fair market value. The terms of the leases are 3 years with an option to renew. For the 2017 growing season, two (2) sites have been identified by city staff. This program is designed to support urban agriculture development to increase local food production and community food security. The City encourages applications from qualified individuals, businesses, and/or nonprofit organizations to apply for a lease agreement. This is a great opportunity for those who want to grow food on a larger scale, but do not have the property to do so.

Those interested in any of the opportunities in the Asheville Edibles Program can visit the OoS website to review the rules and find an application form.

Food Policy Action Plan:

Through the City's contract with Bountiful Cities, the Asheville Buncombe Food Policy Coordinator (ABFPC) and the OoS have been working to revise and update the City's Food Policy Action Plan (FPAP).

The FPAP revision public survey closed at the end of February with 145 participants having submitted their input regarding priorities around Asheville's food system. Included in this process was a public input session held at Hillcrest on February 10th in an attempt to support the participation of low income individuals to complete the survey, as well.

The ABFPC coordinator processed the survey results, grouping answers into categories based on priorities expressed along with the present goals within the City's existing plan. Additional experts from the State's Local Food Council, NC and Community Food Strategies have been invited to weigh in on the suggesting action items identified.

Next steps include draft recommendations to be presented to the necessary COA departments and personnel for approval/input; followed by a presentation to Planning & Economic Development Committee this summer."

In response to Councilman Bothwell, Ms. Ball said that we are looking at best practices for a model for community gardens.

IV. PUBLIC HEARINGS:

A. PUBLIC HEARING TO RECEIVE COMMENTS REGARDING THE CONSOLIDATED ACTION PLAN FOR FISCAL YEAR 2017-18 WHICH SETS OUT THE PROPOSED USE OF FEDERAL COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT AND HOME INVESTMENT PARTNERSHIP ACT FUNDS FOR THE COMING YEAR

RESOLUTION NO. 17-89 - RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING SUBMISSION OF THE CITY'S CONSOLIDATED ANNUAL ACTION PLAN FOR 2017-18 TO THE U.S. DEPT. OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT

Community Development Manager Heather Dillashaw said that this is a public hearing to receive comments regarding the proposed Consolidated Action Plan for Fiscal Year (FY) 2017-18, which sets out the proposed use of federal Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) and HOME Investment Partnership Act (HOME) funds for the coming fiscal year; followed immediately by Council's consideration of a resolution authorizing submission of this Consolidated Action Plan to the US Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD). This public hearing was advertised on April 28 and May 5, 2017.

Ms. Dillashaw was happy to report that the federal budget for HUD Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) and HOME Investment Partnership Funds for Fiscal Year 2017-18 was adopted. Basically, this means the recommendations made by the Housing & Community Development Committee and the HOME Consortium Board will be able to be fully funded with the approval of the Asheville City Council.

It is estimated that based on last year's federal allocation the City will have available approximately \$1,271,940 in CDBG funds and \$981,153 in HOME funds in the fiscal year beginning July 1, 2017.

The City's Housing and Community Development Committee has made recommendations for the use of CDBG funds, which must be used in housing or community development programs in Asheville, and the Asheville Regional Housing Consortium has recommended uses for the HOME funds, which must be used for housing programs within the four-county Consortium area (Buncombe, Henderson, Madison, and Transylvania counties). A total of 31 programs are recommended for funding. Allocations are consistent with the proposed Strategic Housing & Community Plan for 2015-2019.

The Community Development Division will continue to monitor the current federal budget status and propose amendments as needed, once an approved federal budget is in place.

A public hearing will be held at the Council meeting of May 9, 2017. Comments received at the meeting will be incorporated into the Plan, as will comments submitted in writing. The plan is due to be submitted to HUD by May 15. The following is a summary of funding recommendations.

SUMMARY OF ANNUAL ACTION PLAN FOR 2017-2018

CDBG PROGRAM

Projected Revenue:

| | |
|---|---------------------|
| Estimated 2017-18 Program Income | \$ 339,939 |
| Unbudgeted Program Income | - |
| Funds available for reallocation | - |
| New CDBG Entitlement Grant | \$ 932,001 |
| Total CDBG Funds Available: | \$ 1,271,940 |

Proposed Use of Funds:

| 2017-2018 PROGRAM | Funding Recommend. |
|---|---------------------------|
| Asheville Area Habitat for Humanity - Home Repair | \$ 64,000 |
| Asheville Area Habitat for Humanity - Homeowner Services | \$ 58,836 |
| Carolina Small Business Development Fund – Western Women’s Business Center | \$ 85,000 |
| Eagle Market Street Development Corporation – IDA for Small Business | \$ 70,000 |
| Green Opportunities – Workforce Development: New Model for Stability & Growth | \$ 175,000 |
| Helpmate - Domestic Violence Services | \$ 20,000 |
| Homeward Bound - AHOPE Coordinated Assessment | \$ 50,000 |
| Homeward Bound – Prevention and Rapid Re-Housing | \$ 90,000 |
| Housing Authority of the City of Asheville - Lee Walker Heights | \$ 179,703 |
| Mountain BizWorks – Opportunity Asheville | \$ 88,750 |
| Mountain Housing Opportunities - Emergency Home Repair | \$ 110,000 |
| OnTrack - Financial Capabilities Program | \$ 20,000 |
| Pisgah Legal Services - Homelessness Prevention Project | \$ 41,000 |
| YWCA - Drop in Childcare | \$ 19,263 |
| City of Asheville - Program Administration | \$ 200,388 |
| RECOMMENDED FUNDING | \$1,271,940 |

HOME INVESTMENT PARTNERSHIP PROGRAM

Projected Revenue:

| | |
|--|------------|
| Estimated 2017-18 Program Income | \$ 19,526 |
| Unbudgeted 2016-2017 Program Income | - |
| Funds available for reallocation | - |
| New HOME Entitlement Grant | \$ 961,627 |
| Total HOME Funds Available: | \$ 981,153 |

Proposed Use of Funds:

| 2017-2018 PROGRAM | Funding Recommend. |
|---|---------------------------|
| Asheville Area Habitat for Humanity – Tunnel Road Development | \$ 68,038 |
| Homeward Bound – Asheville Tenant Based Rental Assistance | \$ 55,000 |
| Mountain Housing Opportunities – East Haven Apartments | \$ 675,000 |
| Homeward Bound-TBRA Buncombe County wide | \$ 85,000 |
| City of Asheville - Program Administration | \$ 98,115 |
| RECOMMENDED FUNDING | \$ 981,153 |

Pros:

- Approval of the Action Plan paves the way for the receipts of over \$2,250,000 of HUD funding to the City, which will be used to create affordable housing, create jobs, and improve public infrastructure.
- Reflects the carefully considered recommendations of the City's Housing & Community Development Committee and the Asheville Regional Housing Consortium.

Con:

- It is not possible to fund all the applications received, and most of those funded will receive less than the amount requested.

The Action Plan is fully funded from federal CDBG & HOME entitlement grants, unused funds from previous completed projects, and estimated program income. Staff costs to administer the program are also fully paid from federal sources. The funded programs will provide new construction and other economic activity in the City and region, creating and sustaining employment. New assisted housing units to be constructed in Asheville will add significantly to the City's tax base.

Staff recommends approval of the resolution authorizing submission of the City's Consolidated Annual Action Plan for 2017-18 to the U. S. Dept. of Housing and Urban Development.

Councilman Smith said that once the bond passed, the Housing Authority questioned if they might be able to qualify for some of the bond funding rather than having it come out of the CDBG funds. As always, there is more people applying for funds than we have. The Housing Authority said they would volunteer to come out of CDBG funding if they can guarantee their funding from another source within the City. What that did was to allow us to fully fund every single application. If Council moves to have the Housing Authority money come out of the bond funds, it will allow us to have an additional \$315,000 towards community efforts this year. Council will be required to take action on whether to leave the Lee Walker Heights money in CDBG or to move it out and allow for that reserve allocation to happen later in the year.

Mayor Manheimer opened the public hearing at 7:13 p.m. and when no one commented, she closed the public hearing at 7:13 p.m.

Mayor Manheimer said that members of Council have previously received a copy of the resolution and it would not be read.

Councilwoman Mayfield moved to (1) approve the recommended funding levels as presented, with the deletion of the Housing Authority Lee Walker Heights Project allocation of \$179,703, allocate the \$179,703 to reserve, and submit the City's Consolidated Annual Action Plan for 2017-18 to the U. S. Dept. of Housing and Urban Development; and (2) proceed with amending the City's 2016-17 Consolidated Action Plan to reallocate the Housing Authority Lee Walker Heights allocation of \$179,703. This motion was seconded by Vice-Mayor Wisler and carried unanimously.

Councilwoman Mayfield moved that \$179,703 funding previously allocated for the Housing Authority Lee Walker Heights Project not come out of the CDBG funds but instruct staff to find replacement funding either through bond funding or possibly Section 108 money. This motion was seconded by Vice-Mayor Wisler and carried unanimously.

RESOLUTION BOOK NO. 38 – PAGE 425

B. PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A CONDITIONAL ZONING FROM INSTITUTIONAL DISTRICT TO INSTITUTIONAL DISTRICT/CONDITIONAL

ZONING FOR THE EXPANSION AND UPGRADE OF A WASTE TRANSFER STATION AT THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 190 HOMINY CREEK ROAD

ORDINANCE NO. 4581 - ORDINANCE TO CONDITIONALLY ZONING FROM INSTITUTIONAL DISTRICT TO INSTITUTIONAL DISTRICT/CONDITIONAL ZONING FOR THE EXPANSION AND UPGRADE OF A WASTE TRANSFER STATION AT THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 190 HOMINY CREEK ROAD

Mayor Manheimer said that this public hearing was continued from the April 25, 2017, meeting to this date.

Urban Planner Sasha Vrtunski said that this is the consideration of an ordinance to conditionally zone from Institutional District to Institutional District/Conditional Zoning for the expansion and upgrade of a waste transfer station at the property located at 190 Hominy Creek Road. This public hearing was advertised on April 14 and 21, 2017.

Since the original submittal, Buncombe County has changed their proposal to include a sidewalk and additional trees along the greenway to increase the screening of the new building. Those items are reviewed below.

The project site is 12.40 acres on Hominy Creek Road along the French Broad River and is the current site of the Buncombe County Transfer Station. The transfer station is located on an old landfill site, surrounded by trees on all sides. This parcel was newly created in early February from a parent tract of 22 acres (not yet mapped by Buncombe County). Adjacent to the property is Hominy Creek Park at the southern end of the road. The French Broad River greenway runs north from the park, along the eastern edge of the subject property next to the river, connecting to Carrier Park and other greenway trails. Notably, this property is located near two existing greenways and a potential future greenway leading to the WNC Farmers Market, and the road is frequently used by cyclists, paddlers and walkers/runners.

The proposal is for the renovation and expansion to the existing Buncombe County transfer station. The project includes a new building, parking and vehicular use area and upgrades. The proposed new building is 19,801 square feet and contains a smaller lower level. The new building will be approximately 7 feet taller than the existing transfer station building.

The site currently has two driveways leading to two different buildings and functions. The driveways are proposed to stay unchanged. Parking spaces are being provided for the service bays and employees, and total 14 spaces with one required handicapped space. Two bicycle parking spaces are shown on the plans. For a redevelopment project of this type, a sidewalk is required per UDO standards. The applicant has proposed providing a 6 foot back of curb sidewalk for the upper portion of the site, with a pedestrian crossing to the other side of the street, and continuing with a 10 foot multi-use path and a 5 foot landscape strip for the remaining parcel frontage. She said an additional sentence on this condition (which Buncombe County has agreed to) would be that the six foot sidewalk will extend between 218 feet and 320 feet before crossing Hominy Creek Road. City staff will work with Buncombe County to determine the best point of crossing based on pedestrian safety and flood regulations, and will be so indicated on the site plan at that time.

Required landscaping for this project includes street trees, building impact, parking lot landscaping and street buffers. There are significant trees and plant material already present on the perimeters of the site, and it is anticipated that there will be more than enough tree credits to fulfill the tree requirement for building impact landscaping.

The applicant is requesting landscaping reductions for the parking lot landscaping. Parking lot landscaping is required to be within 15 feet of the vehicle use area, making it difficult

to meet as this site has severe restrictions on planting on top of the landfill. Shrubs, however, can be planted around the vehicular use areas.

This project includes a several conditions found in the B1-Conditions list. Modifications and special conditions to note include:

1. Reduced parking lot landscaping: reduced by 54 trees.
2. Additional landscaping along the greenway to provide additional screening between the greenway and the new building. Applicant is proposing to plant 54 trees in this area.

This proposal was approved with conditions by the Technical Review Committee (TRC) on February 20, 2017. As with all conditional zoning applications, this proposal was reviewed by the Planning and Zoning Commission on April 5, 2017, and was approved with a 5-2 vote. Several commission members were concerned about the applicant not building a sidewalk on Hominy Creek Road. The discussion focused on the amount of traffic related to Hominy Creek Park (Cycling, paddling) and the connection between the park and the Hominy Creek Greenway that ends at Shelburne Road, very close to Hominy Creek Road.

City Council provides the final review of the conditional zoning request. The proposal will return to the Technical Review Committee for a final TRC review if approved by City Council. Transportation staff has received communication from members of the Greenway Committee and Friends of Hominy Creek Greenway. These citizens were concerned about the original plans which called for no sidewalk along Hominy Creek Road, and there were also concerns about the view of the new building from the greenway.

The change in zoning is required because under the current Institutional zoning a waste transfer station is not allowed; therefore, an expansion of a non-conforming use is not allowed. Industrial zoning is the appropriate zoning for the operation.

There are no recent projects close to this site. In the general area, recent projects include the Ashcroft Subdivision (Major Subdivision, 2017, in final review) and the Hampton Inn and Suites (Level II project, 2016, under construction).

This site is fairly isolated, located between I-40, the Biltmore Estate and the NC Farmer's Market, accessed only by Hominy Creek Road. The majority of surrounding zoning is Buncombe County zoning: Public Service (PS) district for the WNC Farmer's Market, Conference Center/Resort (CR) zoning for the Biltmore Estate. Given the isolated nature and scale of the site and the unique attributes of the on-going operation, staff believes that this will continue to be a compatible use for this location.

This proposal aligns with several aspects of the *City Development Plan 2025* including "Continue to promote and facilitate effective and efficient governmental coordination" and "Continue to direct a substantial amount of solid waste and organic materials away from landfill disposal... through recycling and reuse."

Considerations:

- Project expands a current use in an isolated location with very limited impacts on the nearby West Asheville neighborhoods.
- The transfer station is substantially screened by existing vegetation.
- Applicant has revised plans to include a sidewalk and multi-use path along the parcel frontage.
- Owner/applicant has proposed adding trees along the greenway to further reduce the visual impact of the new building from the greenway.

Based on policies stated in the Comprehensive Plan and other plans, such as the 2036

Council Vision, staff finds this request to be reasonable and within the best public interest and recommends support of the conditional zoning as proposed.

When Councilwoman Mayfield asked if there are any plans to extend a path to the entrance of the park, Ms. Vrtunski said that the Buncombe County Greenway Plan calls for a greenway to happen on either side of that creek that would connect the Hominy Creek Greenway into the park. There is also a proposed greenway that would come over from the Farmer's Market across that creek.

Mr. Jon Creighton, Assistant County Manager, said that they want to replace their existing transfer station. He showed various views around the transfer station and said that they will work with City staff to determine the best point of crossing based on pedestrian safety and flood regulations.

Mayor Manheimer opened the public hearing at 7:29 p.m.

Mr. Rich Lee, Vice-Chair of the Greenway Committee and member of the Multimodal Transportation Commission, was excited to see the compromise on the sidewalk and multi-use path for this vital connector for bicycles and pedestrians.

Mayor Manheimer closed the public hearing at 7:31 p.m.

Mayor Manheimer said that members of Council have previously received a copy of the ordinance and it would not be read.

Councilman Smith moved to approve the the conditional zoning request from Institutional District (INST) to Industrial Conditional Zone (IND-CZ) with the requested condition for the reduced landscaping and find that the request is reasonable, is in the public interest, and is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan and other adopted plans in that: (1) the site has historically been an industrial use; (2) additional landscaping and the location serves to largely conceal the facility from adjacent uses and the nearby neighborhood; (3) the facility is integral to the City's solid waste and recycling functions; and, (4) the expansion and upgrading of the facility eliminates the need to relocate this use to another part of the community. This motion was seconded by Councilman Bothwell and carried unanimously.

ORDINANCE BOOK NO. 31 - PAGE 192

Closed Session

At 7:32 p.m., Councilman Young moved to go into closed session for the following reasons: (1) to prevent disclosure of information that is privileged and confidential, pursuant to the laws of North Carolina, or not considered a public record within the meaning of Chapter 132 of the General Statutes. The law that makes the information privileged and confidential is N.C.G.S. 143-318.10(a)(3). The statutory authorization is contained in N.C.G.S. 143-318.11(a)(1); and (2) To consult with an attorney employed by the City about matters with respect to which the attorney-client privilege between the City and its attorney must be preserved, including, but not limited to, a lawsuit involving the following parties: Civil Service Board Grievance - Richard Grant; and City of Asheville v. Robert H. Frost. The statutory authorization is contained in N.C. Gen. Stat. § 143-318.11(a)(3). This motion was seconded by Vice-Mayor Wisler and carried unanimously.

At 7:55 p.m., Vice-Mayor Wisler moved to come out of closed session. This motion was seconded by Councilman Smith and carried unanimously.

V. UNFINISHED BUSINESS:

VI. NEW BUSINESS:

A. RESOLUTION NO. 17-90 - RESOLUTION REAPPOINTING MEMBERS AND CHAIR TO THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD

Vice-Mayor Wisler, Chair of the Boards & Commissions Committee, said that it is the responsibility of City Council to appoint the Chair of the Civil Service Board and the Chair of the Civil Service Board shall be appointed annually by City Council. In addition, the terms of Carol Goins and Alan Escovitz as members of the Civil Service Board expire June 11, 2017.

In 2013, a process was established for future appointments to the chair role of the Civil Service Board. Said process offered members of the Civil Service Board to express interest in serving as Chair.

All members were advised to contact Deputy City Clerk Sarah Terwilliger if they were interested in serving as Chair. Mr. Alan Coxie was the only interested member. The term of the current Chair Alan Coxie expires on June 28, 2017.

Vice-Mayor Wisler moved to reappoint Mr. Alan Coxie as Chairman of the Civil Service Board to serve a one-year term until his successor is duly appointed or until his term on the Civil Service Board expires, whichever occurs first. This motion was seconded by Councilman Smith and carried unanimously.

Vice-Mayor Wisler then moved to reappoint Ms. Carol Goins and Mr. Alan Escovitz to each serve an additional two year term, terms to expire June 11, 2019, or until their successors have been appointed. This motion was seconded by Councilman Bothwell and carried unanimously.

RESOLUTION BOOK NO. 38 - PAGE 426

B. RESOLUTION NO. 17-91 – RESOLUTION APPOINTING A MEMBER TO THE HOMELESS INITIATIVE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Vice-Mayor Wisler, Chair of the Boards & Commissions Committee, said that Allison Bond, representative for the veterans' administration on the Homeless Initiative Advisory Committee (HIAC), resigned, thus leaving an unexpired vacancy until November 1, 2018.

The following individual, who fit the designated seat vacancy, applied for the vacancy: Whitney Lott.

At the recommendation of the Homeless Initiative Advisory Committee (HIAC) to appoint Ms. Lott even though she is not a City resident. They felt that 40% of our homeless population are veterans, making it critical for the lead person in the VA Homeless Programs office to be a seated member of HIAC. There is not a city resident who holds this position at the VA and would be able to bring the knowledge and expertise critical to HIAC's work on reducing and ending veteran homeless in our community. It was the consensus of the Boards & Commissions Committee to appoint Whitney Lott.

Vice-Mayor Wisler moved to appoint Whitney Lott to serve as the veterans' administration representative on the Homeless Initiative Advisory Committee, term to expire November 1, 2018, or until her successors has been appointed. This motion was seconded by Councilman Bothwell and carried unanimously.

RESOLUTION BOOK NO. 38- PAGE 427

VII. INFORMAL DISCUSSION AND PUBLIC COMMENT:

Vice-Mayor Wisler said that at the Boards & Commissions Committee meeting held earlier in the day, they talked about the Citizens-Police Advisory Committee (CPAC) and the possible establishment of a Human Relations Commission. Due to time constraints, it was the consensus of the Committee to hold a special meeting on Monday, May 22, 2017, at 10:00 a.m. in Room 209 of City Hall to continue the discussion of (1) the mission/make-up of CPAC; (2) potential formation of a Human Relations Commission; and (3) Neighborhood Opportunity Fund.

Due to the number of individuals requesting to speak on items presented under the Presentations portion of the meeting, Councilwoman Mayfield moved to waive the rules and allow speakers to comment on those items. This motion was seconded by Councilman Bothwell and carried unanimously.

Mr. Vijay Kapoor commented on the 2017-18 budget and felt there was a lack of information on specific projects related to the bonds. He also felt that an additional 15 police officers requested is one year is rare and asked for the demonstrated need for those additional officers.

Mr. Sidney Bach expressed concern on the City's accounting system and the upcoming approval of a property tax increase to pay the interest and principal on the yet-issued General Obligation bonds.

The following individuals commented on the Asheville Police Department and Mr. Ian Mance's reports on traffic stops and search data:

Ms. Dee Williams, Chair of the NAACP Criminal Justice Committee
Mr. Patrick Conant
Mr. Ian Mance, attorney with the Southern Coalition for Social Justice
Ms. Catherine Kerr
Ms. Darlene Azarmi
Ms. Ashley Cooper
Mr. Rondell Lance

Councilman Smith urged the public to advocate to our legislators in Raleigh to raise the age of juvenile jurisdiction from 16 to 18 in North Carolina for misdemeanants and non-violent felons. On April 25, 2017, City Council supported this action.

Councilman Bothwell urged the community to support a new organization called Appalachian Wild who take care of injured wildlife.

Councilman Young stated that he attended a class at the School of Government that focused on evaluating and assessing boards and commissions. He will provide Council with the best practices formulated across the state.

VIII. ADJOURNMENT:

Mayor Manheimer adjourned the meeting at 8:46 p.m.

CITY CLERK

MAYOR